

Mr Chris Hynd
Committee Assistant
Public Petitions Committee
The Scottish Parliament
Edinburgh
EH99 1SP

31 January 2012

Dear Mr Hynd,

St Margaret of Scotland Hospice (Petition PE 1105)

Thank you for the opportunity to respond to the Scottish Government's letter (8th November 2011) detailing the developments in relation to the progress of the revised guidance on adult Hospice funding.

A meeting of short life working group (SLWG) on Hospice Commissioning took place on 15th December 2011 where suggested amendments to the draft CEL were considered by the group, with the intention of "refreshing the language and terminology of HDL 2003 (18)." A representative of St Margaret of Scotland Hospice was present at the meeting, which was attended by representatives from the Scottish Government, Scottish Hospices Forum, NHS Lothian and NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde. Written comments on the suggested changes to the draft CEL were submitted to the Scottish Government on 17 January 2012 and a further meeting of the SLWG is awaited. The Commissioning Group has by no means reached any conclusion and the draft CEL requires to be substantially revised if it is to bring any comfort to Hospices, individually or collectively, in terms of Hospice funding arrangements. We do however recognise the challenge surrounding the HDL may be unique to St Margaret of Scotland Hospice as the current baseline funding to the Hospice is significantly less than the other NHS GG&C Hospices and the wider Scottish Hospices.

The commissioning framework seeks to create a "common and consistent approach to commissioning between NHS Boards and the independent adult hospices." This approach will be welcome as at present, discussions with Health Boards do not achieve this level of consistency in relation to individual Hospice funding.

To reiterate my concerns from my letter to the Petitions Committee on 16 September 2011, and update the Petition Committee members on progress to date with NHS GG&C in relation to the completion of signing a contract for the Hospice:

- On 20th June 2011, St Margaret's were presented with a general style contract prepared by the Central Legal Office. The contract took the form of an agreement between the Board and a nursing home.
- The draft contract was considerably revised by the senior management team at the Hospice and returned to NHS GG&C on 12th August 2011 encompassing both Palliative Care and NHS Continuing Care.

- With no further news of the contract, this matter was raised by a Health Board member at the Board meeting of NHS GG&C on 20th December 2011 regarding lack of contact with St Margaret's. It was agreed by Ms Catriona Renfrew, Director of Corporate Planning and Policy, NHS GG&C, that the draft contract which had been received from the Hospice had not yet been returned to the Hospice and was currently with the Acute Services Division, adding "it was not high up the agenda for the Director of Rehabilitation and Assessment with everything else going on in Older People's services" but assurance was given that "the objective would be set for tying up loose ends" and a report would be produced for the next Health Board meeting on 21st February 2012 to update the Health Board members.
- Without any discussion or negotiation, a pre-signed document was received from NHS GG&C on 12th January 2012, which will require further revision. There was an offer within the letter to meet or discuss, but I find it difficult to comprehend how a pre-signed document could be issued without any discussions. Within the pre-signed contract there were two sets of figures presented, one for Specialist Palliative Care and one for NHS Continuing Care, neither of which had any explanation or rationale. The funding model remains unclear. Furthermore, the term of the contract is for one year for Specialist Palliative Care as the Director of Rehabilitation and Assessment was unable to offer a longer term due to "new guidance which they anticipate from the Scottish Government later this year."

I would respectfully suggest that it is of paramount importance that the Petitions Committee members set in context the reasons behind the Petition in the first place. Its clear intention was to address two specific issues facing the Hospice:

1. The future of 30 continuing care beds at the Hospice – this closure notice has been withdrawn by NHS GG&C and it is around this that the contract has been developed
2. Hospice funding arrangements and the disparity in funding which St Margaret of Scotland Hospice receives in comparison to other Hospices in Scotland for the provision of Specialist Palliative Care. I attach a more recent table which shows the funding of Scottish Hospices and would wish to draw the attention of the Petition Committee members to the substantial continued differential in funding per bed which is strikingly unfair towards St Margaret of Scotland Hospice.

I greatly appreciate that the petition has been kept open for this period of time and ask that this remains the same until the Hospice funding arrangements have been entirely and comprehensively addressed and have fully resolved.

Yours sincerely

Jean Anne Mitchell

Additional Information for Petitions Committee

- St Margaret Scotland Hospice provides 58 in-patient beds for Specialist Palliative Care and Continuing Care of the Older Adult with complex medical and nursing needs. The Hospice also provides Day Hospice, Community Specialist Palliative Care, Out-Patient services, Counselling and Bereavement Support, in addition to 24 hour telephone support.
- At the Petitions Committee meeting on Tuesday, 4 October 2011, Sandra White, MSP referred to a “clash between St Margaret of Scotland Hospice and Blawarthill Hospital.” There has never been a clash between St Margaret’s and Blawarthill Hospital.
- The reason for the reference to a nursing home is that the original contract sent to the Hospice by NHS Greater Glasgow and Clyde in June 2011 was a standard agreement between the Health Board and a nursing home provider – which has now been revised to cover the care provided by the Hospice.
- Four Seasons Health Care would not have had an impact on St Margaret’s. Had the Blawarthill Hospital plan continued the Provider would have been Southern Cross Healthcare.
- I draw your attention to the attached Scottish Hospice funding table which highlights the disparity in funding across Scottish Hospices.

Implementation of HDL(2003)18

NHS Board Funding of Specialist Palliative Care services provided by Scottish adult voluntary hospices for years ending 31 March 2008 and 31 March 2009

Year ending:	TOTAL running costs for hospice as shown in the Annual Accounts / Statement of Financial Activities for:		Total AGREED costs for hospice with service level agreement with NHS Board(s) at 31 March 2008 and/or 31 March 2009:		Total income received from local NHS Board(s) in:		Percentage of TOTAL running costs NHS Board funding represented in:		Percentage of total AGREED running costs NHS Board funding represented in:		No of beds	Cost per bed	Funding per bed
	2008	2009	2008	2009	2007-2008	2008-2009	2008	2009	2008	2009			
Accord (GG&C)	£ 2,075,938	£ 2,427,025	N/A	N/A	£ 958,190	£ 1,044,836	46.16%	43.05%	N/A	N/A	8	£ 303,378	£ 130,605
Ardgowan (GG&C)	£ 2,204,717	£ 2,352,588	N/A	N/A	£ 967,030	£ 1,054,622	43.90%	44.80%	N/A	N/A	8	£ 294,074	£ 131,828
Bethesda (WI) (1)	£ 464,161	£ 469,765	N/A	N/A	£ 231,840	£ 231,840	50%	49%	N/A	N/A	4	£ 117,441	£ 57,960
Highland (H)	£ 3,348,899	£ 3,671,165	£ 2,469,610	£ 2,642,850	£ 1,145,944	£ 1,276,077	34.22%	34.76%	46.40%	48.28%	10	£ 367,117	£ 127,608
Marie Curie Fairmile (Lo)	£ 3,572,525	£ 3,941,003	N/A	N/A	£ 1,440,930	£ 1,562,415	40.33%	39.65%	N/A	N/A	27	£ 145,963	£ 57,867
Marie Curie Hunters Hill (GG&C)	£ 3,857,501	£ 4,364,645	N/A	N/A	£ 1,815,997	£ 1,887,820	47.10%	44.90%	N/A	N/A	35	£ 124,704	£ 53,938
Prince & Princess of Wales (GG&C)(2)	£ 3,396,050	£ 3,664,314	N/A	N/A	£ 1,399,800	£ 1,470,964	41.20%	40.10%	N/A	N/A	14	£ 261,737	£ 105,069
St Andrews (Lan)(3)	£ 4,378,288	£ 4,923,279	£ 3,773,785	£ 3,905,867	£ 1,713,361	£ 1,773,501	39.10%	36%	45.40%	45.40%	20	£ 246,164	£ 88,675
St Columbas (Lo)	£ 5,834,384	£ 5,850,648	N/A	N/A	£ 2,445,440	£ 2,434,991	41.90%	41.60%	N/A	N/A	30	£ 195,022	£ 81,166
St Margarets (GG&C)	£ 1,943,624	£ 2,598,530	N/A	N/A	£ 938,040	£ 986,158	48.26%	37.95%	N/A	N/A	26	£ 99,943	£ 37,929
St Vincents (GG&C)(4)	£ 1,584,141	£ 1,698,345	N/A	£ 1,691,700	£ 826,121	£ 858,572	52%	50.70%	N/A	49.80%	8	£ 212,293	£ 107,322
Strathcarron (FV&Lan)	£ 4,291,369	£ 4,865,455	£ 4,175,427	£ 4,282,489	£ 1,761,808	£ 1,934,511	41.00%	39.70%	42.20%	45%	24	£ 202,727	£ 80,605
The Ayrshire (A&A)	£ 5,111,113	£ 5,589,878	£ 4,159,634	£ 4,482,088	£ 2,052,924	£ 2,217,591	40.20%	39.70%	49.40%	49.50%	20	£ 279,494	£ 110,880
Average Percentage							43.49%	41.69%	45.85%	47.60%	234	£ 219,235	£ 90,112

* Footnote

(1) Bethesda Hospice

- Still being covered by locum doctors and this is reflected in the increased costs. Have not had an increase in the general running costs for three years. Although the health board have continued to fund 50% of costs, they do not have an SLA in place.

(2) Prince & Princess of Wales Hospice

- These costs include the direct costs of their lottery (£321,422 – 2009, £299,179 – 2008) (45.2% -2008, 44% - 2009) which they would not expect NHS to fund. They also include other costs which they know that NHS are unlikely to fund.

(3) St Andrew's Hospice

- NHSL pay their three consultants directly and the cost is £454,000 in 2009. If this was regarded as income and expenditure for them, the percentage of total costs would be 44.8% for 2008 and 41.4% for 2009, the percentage of agreed costs would be 51.2% for 2008 and 49.2% for 2009.
- There are £600,000 fundraising costs included in total running costs for 2008 and £750K for 2009 for which they do not expect any contribution from NHSL. These are adventure trips, lottery, annual ball etc.

(4) St Vincent's Hospice

- Although SLA not in place yet, work is progressing on that, the letter regarding funding was named 2008/09 Service Agreement.
- Increased % due to extra projected funding for new posts